Falsification of Synchronous and Hybrid Systems using Automatic Differentiation SYNCHRON'19

Ismail Bennani

PhD Student, PARKAS, INRIA

supervised by

Marc PouzetGoran FrehseTimothy BourkePARKAS, INRIAU2IS, ENSTA ParisPARKAS, INRIA

November 28, 2019

Introduction

The bouncing ball

```
Discrete
                                                          Hvbrid
let node ball v_0 = v where
  rec y = y<sub>0</sub> \rightarrow pre (y +. dt *. y_v)
                                            let hybrid ball y_0 = y where
                                              rec der y = y_v init y_0
  and y_v = 0. \rightarrow
    if bounce then
                                               and der y_v = -. g init 0.0
         (-. 0.8 *. pre v_v)
                                                   reset bounce \rightarrow
                                                      (-. 0.8 *. last y_v)
    else
         pre (y_v -. dt *. g)
                                               and bounce = up(-, y)
  and bounce = y < 0.
```

In this talk: a (very) quick overview of FADBADml¹, a library for Automatic Differentiation in OCaml implemented by François Bidet and myself.

¹https://fadbadml-dev.github.io/FADBADml/

Ismail Bennani - Falsification of Synchronous and Hybrid Systems using ,Automatic Differentiation - SYNCHRON'19

Falsification problem Example State of the art

Automatic Differentiation : FADBADml

Falsification with FADBADml A word about specification Example: a simple ODE Synchronous system: the automatic transmission WIP: the heater

Falsification problem Example State of the art

Automatic Differentiation : FADBADml

Falsification with FADBADml

- A word about specification
- Example: a simple ODE
- Synchronous system: the automatic transmission
- WIP: the heater

Falsification problem Given a System Under Test SUT and a specification *spec*, find an input I such that the output O doesn't satisfy spec(I, O)

Example: SUT = model of an F-16 aircraft with a Ground Collision Avoidance System (GCAS) → inputs: initial position and rotation → outputs at time t: current position, rotation, velocity, angular velocity, ... spec = the aircraft doesn't crash

Falsification problem Example State of the art

Automatic Differentiation : FADBADml

Falsification with FADBADml

- A word about specification
- Example: a simple ODE
- Synchronous system: the automatic transmission
- WIP: the heater

Falsification problem: F-16 aircraft



Ismail Bennani - Falsification of Synchronous and Hybrid Systems using ,Automatic Differentiation - SYNCHRON'19

Falsification problem: Uniform Random sampling

Specification : The F16 does not crash Plot space $\phi_0 \in [0.1\pi, 0.9\pi]$, $\theta_0 \in [-0.5\pi, 0]$ Search space $\phi_0 \in [0.2\pi, 0.2833\pi]$, $\theta_0 \in [-0.4\pi, -0.35\pi]$ Number of points : 5000



Ismail Bennani - Falsification of Synchronous and Hybrid Systems using ,Automatic Differentiation - SYNCHRON'19

Falsification problem Example State of the art

Automatic Differentiation : FADBADml

Falsification with FADBADml

- A word about specification
- Example: a simple ODE
- Synchronous system: the automatic transmission
- WIP: the heater

Falsification problem : State of the art Breach Donzé (2010), S-TaLiro Annpureddy et al. (2011)



Main Idea

instead of asking "Is spec satisfied by SUT ?", ask "How much is spec satisfied by SUT ?"

 \rightarrow compute a robustness (float) instead of a boolean.

The <u>falsification</u> problem becomes a <u>minimization</u> problem : spec(I, O) is not satisfied $\Leftrightarrow spec(I, O) < 0$

Falsification problem : State of the art other tools: FalStar, falsify

Method FalStar: Two layered falsification with tree search (MCTS Zhang et al. (2018), aLVTS Ernst et al. (2018)) falsify: Deep Reinforcement Learning Akazaki et al. (2018)

Both methods are <u>online</u>: at each step, the tools produce a new input based on the last outputs

Falsification problem Example State of the art

Automatic Differentiation : FADBADml

Falsification with FADBADml

- A word about specification
- Example: a simple ODE
- Synchronous system: the automatic transmission
- WIP: the heater

Automatic Differentiation : FADBADml Porting of FADBAD++ in OCaml by François Bidet and I

FADBAD++ Stauning (1997):

- C++ library for Automatic Differentiation
- written by Ole Stauning as part of his PhD thesis.

FADBADml is available at github and can be installed with opam

Automatic Differentiation : FADBADml Porting of FADBAD++ in OCaml by François Bidet and I

FADBAD++ Stauning (1997):

- C++ library for Automatic Differentiation
- written by Ole Stauning as part of his PhD thesis.

FADBADml is available at github and can be installed with opam

Example: let z = x + y, FADBADml defines a type F<float> and overloads the operator + to compute $\frac{dz}{dx}$ and $\frac{dz}{dy}$ at runtime (knowing that $\frac{dx}{dx} = 1$ and $\frac{dy}{dy} = 1$)

Note: FADBAD++ (and FADBADml) implements forward and backward automatic differentiation as well as a library to compute Taylor coefficients of an equation with respect to one variable. However I will only present FAD, the library for forward differentiation.

Automatic Differentiation : FADBADml

How does it work ? (* a,b floats *) ... let x = make a in let y = make b in $x \begin{cases} v = a \\ diff = [] \end{cases}$ $y \begin{cases} v = b \\ diff = [] \end{cases}$

Automatic Differentiation : FADBADml

How does it work ?
(* a,b floats *)
...
let x = make a in
let y = make b in
diff x 0 2;
diff y 1 2;

$$x \begin{cases} v = a \\ diff = [] \end{cases}$$
 $y \begin{cases} v = b \\ diff = [] \end{cases}$
 $y \begin{cases} v = b \\ diff = [] \end{cases}$

Automatic Differentiation : FADBADml

How does it work ?
(* a,b floats *)
...
let x = make a in
let y = make b in
diff x 0 2;
diff y 1 2;
(* (d z 0) contains dz/dx
and (d z 1) contains dz/dy *)

$$x \begin{cases} v = a \\ diff = [] \end{cases}$$

$$x \begin{cases} v = a \\ diff = [] \end{cases}$$

$$x \begin{cases} v = a \\ diff = [1,0] \end{cases}$$

$$x \begin{cases} v = op_{float}(v_x, v_y) \\ diff = op_{diff}(v_x, v_y, diff_x, diff_y) \end{cases}$$

Example if $op(x, y) = x *_{fad} y$ then $op_{float}(x, y) = x *_{float} y$ and $op_{diff}(v_x, v_y, diff_x, diff_y) = v_y * diff_x +_{vec} v_x * diff_y$

Ismail Bennani - Falsification of Synchronous and Hybrid Systems using ,Automatic Differentiation - SYNCHRON'19

Falsification problem Example State of the art

Automatic Differentiation : FADBADml

Falsification with FADBADml

A word about specification Example: a simple ODE Synchronous system: the automatic transmission WIP: the heater

Falsification problem Example State of the art

Automatic Differentiation : FADBADml

Falsification with FADBADml

A word about specification

Example: a simple ODE Synchronous system: the automatic transmission WIP: the heater

A word about specification A quantitative semantic of basic constructions

Most simple formulas: usual boolean operators

$$\rho(x > f) = x - f$$
$$\rho(x < f) = f - x$$
$$\rho(x \lor y) = max(x, y)$$
$$\rho(x \land y) = min(x, y)$$

- **Sign**: encodes the boolean value
- Absolute value: encodes some kind of score

A word about specification Temporal constructions



 \hookrightarrow these 4 constructions are enough to express all the properties that I found in several benchmarks Ernst et al. (2019) Dokhanchi et al. (2018) Hoxha et al. (2014)

These macros are synchronous observers Halbwachs et al. (1994) They express a subset of MITL (Metric Interval Temporal Logic, the logic used by S-TaLiro, Breach, ...)

My contribution on this: quantitative semantics + continuous version

Ismail Bennani - Falsification of Synchronous and Hybrid Systems using ,Automatic Differentiation - SYNCHRON'19

Falsification problem Example State of the art

Automatic Differentiation : FADBADml

Falsification with FADBADml

A word about specification

Example: a simple ODE

Synchronous system: the automatic transmission WIP: the heater

Example: a simple ODE

$$\begin{cases} \dot{x}(t) = x(t) + y(t) + 0.1t \\ \dot{y}(t) = y(t) * \cos(2\pi y(t)) + x(t) * \sin(2\pi x(t)) + 0.1t \\ x(0) = x_0 \in [-1, 1] \\ y(0) = y_0 \in [-1, 1] \end{cases}$$

Specification: x is always in [-1.6, -1.4]

Example: a simple ODE

$$\begin{cases} \dot{x}(t) = x(t) + y(t) + 0.1t \\ \dot{y}(t) = y(t) * \cos(2\pi y(t)) + x(t) * \sin(2\pi x(t)) + 0.1t \\ x(0) = x_0 \in [-1, 1] \\ y(0) = y_0 \in [-1, 1] \end{cases}$$

Specification: x is always in [-1.6, -1.4]

Falsification problem: find $x_0 \in [-1, 1]$ and $y_0 \in [-1, 1]$ such that $\exists t \in [0, t_{max}] / x(t) \notin [-1.6, -1.4]$

Example: a simple ODE

$$\begin{cases} \dot{x}(t) = x(t) + y(t) + 0.1t \\ \dot{y}(t) = y(t) * \cos(2\pi y(t)) + x(t) * \sin(2\pi x(t)) + 0.1t \\ x(0) = x_0 \in [-1, 1] \\ y(0) = y_0 \in [-1, 1] \end{cases}$$

Specification: x is always in [-1.6, -1.4]

Falsification problem: find $x_0 \in [-1, 1]$ and $y_0 \in [-1, 1]$ such that $\exists t \in [0, t_{max}] / x(t) \notin [-1.6, -1.4]$

$$\begin{array}{ll} (* & (x \ge -1.6) \Leftrightarrow (-1.6 - x \ge 0) & | & (x \le -1.4) \Leftrightarrow (x + 1.4 \ge 0) & *) \\ \textbf{Robustness:} & \rho(x) = \min(-1.6 - x, x + 1.4) \end{array}$$

Example: a simple ODE solved with Euler's integration scheme (fixed step)

System

$$\begin{cases} \dot{x}(t) = x(t) + y(t) + 0.1t \\ \dot{y}(t) = y(t) * \cos(2\pi y(t)) + x(t) * \sin(2\pi x(t)) + 0.1t \\ x(0) = x_0 \\ y(0) = y_0 \end{cases}$$

Execution (dt is a fixed parameter)

 $\begin{array}{l} \mbox{rec }t=0 \to (\mbox{pre }t) \,+\, dt \\ \mbox{and }x=(\mbox{pre }x) \,+\, dt \,*\, ((\mbox{pre }x) \,+\, (\mbox{pre }y) \,+\, 0.1 \,*\, t) \\ \mbox{and }y=(\mbox{pre }y) \,+\, dt \,*\, ((\mbox{pre }y) \,*\, \cos(2*\mbox{pi}*(\mbox{pre }y)) \,+\, \\ (\mbox{pre }x) \,*\, \sin(2*\mbox{pi}*(\mbox{pre }x)) \,+\, 0.1 \,*\, t) \end{array}$

With FADBADml, we can compute dx/dx_0 and dx/dy_0 after any number of steps

Example: a simple ODE with Euler and Gradient Descent Reddi et al. (2019) Specification

$$x \in [-1.6, -1.4] \land$$

 $y \in [-1.1, -0.9]$

Parameters

input space = $[-1, 1] \times [-1, 1]$ dt = 0.1 n_steps = 100

Example: a simple ODE with Euler and Gradient Descent Reddi et al. (2019) Specification

$$x \in [-1.6, -1.4] \land$$

 $y \in [-1.1, -0.9]$

Parameters

input space
$$= [-1,1] \times [-1,1]$$

dt $= 0.1$
n_steps $= 100$

Falsified after 172 tries:

- ▶ best rob = -0.0115205
- sample =

$$\begin{cases} x_0 = -1, \\ y_0 = -0.589587520984 \end{cases}$$

History of GD ADAM														1																									
																		isco.			-	UN	m																
1	Ľ.	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1		1	1	1	1	1	Ľ.	1	1	Ľ.	1	Ľ.	1	Ľ.	Ľ.	1	1	1						Ľ.	1	
	2	2	2						1									٠		2	2		2	2	2		2	2		2		2							
	2	2							1									r			2		2	2			2	2		č.		2					2	2	
	2	2	2						1									r		2	2		2	2	2		2	2		2		2						2	
	2	2	1						1									r					2	2			2			2		2							
		2																₹.												2		2					2		
	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		0	0		0		ł.	0	0	0		0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		0					
	0	0				0			0		0					0		2			0					0	0	0	0	0	0	0				0			
	0	0		0		0	0		0		0					0		1	0		0			0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0			0				
	0	0	0	0		0			0		0		0			0		1		0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		0					
	0	0	0	0		0			0		0					0		٠		0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		0					
	0	0																1			0		0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2							
0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	ŧ	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
	0	0	0			0			0		0		0			0		1	0	0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
0	0	0		0		0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0		0	0	-	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		0		0		0	0		0		4	•	0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		0	0		0		1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	- 60	0		0	0		0			0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	-0	8	•		0			0	.0	þ.	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	₽	0	0	0				0	0	- 0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
	0	0	0	0	0	0		ŀ	0	0	0			1	.0	0	┛	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
	0	0	0			0		•	0	0	0		0	. 0	-		-0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
						0	4	•	0		0		0	0	0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
0		۰		0	۰			.0	0	0	0		0			0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
						•	p		0				.0	0	0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
						ı			0				0	0	0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
				9	ø				0		0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
	0	0	ð	-0		0	0	0	0		0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
	ø	-0	0			0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0						
1	0	0	0			0	0	0	0	0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
	0	0	0			0	0	0	0	0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0						
	0	0	0			0	0	0	0	0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
	0	0	0			0		0	0	0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
	٠	0	0			0		0	0	.0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0						
						0			0	.0	0		0	0	0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
	0	0	0			0	0	0	0	.0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
		0				0	0		0		0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
	0	0	0			0	0	0	0	.0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
	0	0	0		0	0	0	0	0	.0	0		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0							
																			0										0	0	0								

Falsification problem Example State of the art

Automatic Differentiation : FADBADml

Falsification with FADBADml

A word about specification Example: a simple ODE Synchronous system: the automatic transmission WIP: the heater

Synchronous system: automatic transmission (ARCH Comp. 2014) Hoxha et al. (2014) Hoxha et al. (2015)



Input: throttle, brake

Output: gear, speed, rpm

Ismail Bennani - Falsification of Synchronous and Hybrid Systems using ,Automatic Differentiation - SYNCHRON'19

Synchronous system: the automatic transmission, offline falsification



Synchronous system: the automatic transmission, offline falsification



This is the same as before: instead of picking 2 values at the beginning, we pick 4 of them and construct the input with them

Synchronous system: the automatic transmission, online falsification

Online falsification :



DEMO

Falsification problem Example State of the art

Automatic Differentiation : FADBADml

Falsification with FADBADml

A word about specification Example: a simple ODE Synchronous system: the automatic transmission WIP: the heater

WIP: the heater (Nicolas Halbwachs, Collège de France, 2010)

```
let node euler(h)(x0, xprime) = x
where rec x = x0 \rightarrow pre (x +. h *. xprime)
```

```
let node heater(c, \alpha, \beta, temp_ext, temp0, u) = temp where
rec der_temp =
    if u then (c - temp) *. \alpha
        else (temp_ext - temp) *. \beta
and temp = euler(0.2)(temp0, der_temp)
let node relay(low, high, v) = u where
rec u = if v < low then true
        else if v > high then false
        else false \rightarrow pre u
```

```
let node system(reference) = (u, temp) where
rec u = relay(reference -. 1., reference +. 1., temp)
and temp = heater(50.0, 0.1, 0.05, 0.0, 15.0, u)
```

Falsification with FADBADml WIP: the heater

$$\dot{temp} = \begin{cases} \alpha * (c - temp) & \text{if } u \\ \beta * (temp_{ext} - temp) & \text{if } \neg u \end{cases}$$

integrated using euler

$$temp_{n+1} = temp_n + \delta_n * \begin{cases} \alpha * (c - temp_n) & \text{if } u_n \\ \beta * (temp_{ext} - temp_n) & \text{if } \neg u_n \end{cases} \quad u_{n+1} = \begin{cases} true & \text{if } temp_n < ref - low \\ false & \text{if } temp_n > ref - high \\ u_n & \text{else} \end{cases}$$

1

Ismail Bennani - Falsification of Synchronous and Hybrid Systems using ,Automatic Differentiation - SYNCHRON'19

WIP: the heater

$$temp_{n+1} = temp_n + \delta_n * \begin{cases} \alpha * (c - temp_n) & \text{if } u_n \\ \beta * (temp_{ext} - temp_n) & \text{if } \neg u_n \end{cases} \quad u_{n+1} = \begin{cases} true & \text{if } temp_n < ref - low \\ false & \text{if } temp_n > ref - high \\ u_n & \text{else} \end{cases}$$

and $temp_0$ is a constant $u_0 = false$

WIP: the heater

$$temp_{n+1} = temp_n + \delta_n * \begin{cases} \alpha * (c - temp_n) & \text{if } u_n \\ \beta * (temp_{ext} - temp_n) & \text{if } \neg u_n \end{cases} \quad u_{n+1} = \begin{cases} true & \text{if } temp_n < ref - low \\ false & \text{if } temp_n > ref - high \\ u_n & \text{else} \end{cases}$$

and $temp_0$ is a constant $u_0 = false$

We take the partial derivative of temp w.r.t. ref

$$\frac{d}{dref}temp_{n+1} = \frac{d}{dref}temp_n + \delta_n * \begin{cases} -\alpha * \frac{d}{dref}temp_n & \text{if } u_n \\ -\beta * \frac{d}{dref}temp_n & \text{if } \neg u_n \end{cases}$$

WIP: the heater

$$temp_{n+1} = temp_n + \delta_n * \begin{cases} \alpha * (c - temp_n) & \text{if } u_n \\ \beta * (temp_{ext} - temp_n) & \text{if } \neg u_n \end{cases} \quad u_{n+1} = \begin{cases} true & \text{if } temp_n < ref - low \\ false & \text{if } temp_n > ref - high \\ u_n & \text{else} \end{cases}$$

and $temp_0$ is a constant $u_0 = false$

We take the partial derivative of temp w.r.t. ref

$$\frac{d}{dref}temp_{n+1} = \frac{d}{dref}temp_n + \delta_n * \begin{cases} -\alpha * \frac{d}{dref}temp_n & \text{if } u_n \\ -\beta * \frac{d}{dref}temp_n & \text{if } \neg u_n \end{cases}$$

Let's apply with n = 0

$$\frac{d}{dref}temp_{1} = 0 + \delta_{0} * \begin{cases} -\alpha * 0 & \text{if } u_{0} \\ -\beta * 0 & \text{if } \neg u_{0} \end{cases}$$

Ismail Bennani - Falsification of Synchronous and Hybrid Systems using ,Automatic Differentiation - SYNCHRON'19

What happens if we trigger mode transitions ?

First: quantitative semantics over boolean formulas :

$$u_{n+1} = \begin{cases} (ref - low) - temp_n & \text{if } temp_n < ref - low \\ temp_n - (ref - high) & \text{if } temp_n > ref - high \\ u_n & \text{else} \end{cases}$$

Falsification with FADBADml WIP: the heater

What happens if we trigger mode transitions ?

First: quantitative semantics over boolean formulas :

$$u_{n+1} = \begin{cases} (ref - low) - temp_n & \text{if } temp_n < ref - low \\ temp_n - (ref - high) & \text{if } temp_n > ref - high \\ u_n & \text{else} \end{cases}$$

Then: derivatives w.r.t. the input

$$\frac{d}{dref}u_{n+1} = \begin{cases} 1 - \frac{d}{dref}temp_n & \text{if } temp_n < ref - low \\ \frac{d}{dref}temp_n - 1 & \text{if } temp_n > ref - high \\ \frac{d}{dref}u_n & \text{else} \end{cases} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } temp_n < ref - low \\ -1 & \text{if } temp_n > ref - high \\ \frac{d}{dref}u_n & \text{else} \end{cases}$$

WIP: the heater

```
let node relay(low, high, v) = u where
  automaton
  | HTGH \rightarrow
   do u = false
   until (v < low) then LOW (* zc: "trigger_low", rob: low - v *)
   else (v < high) then MID(false) (* zc: "trigger_mid", rob: high - v *)
  | MID(out) \rightarrow
   d_0 = 0
   until (v > high) then HIGH (* zc: "trigger_high", rob: v - high *)
   else (v < low) then LOW
                                     (* zc: "trigger_low", rob: low - v *)
  | LOW \rightarrow
   do u = true
   until (v > high) then HIGH (* zc: "trigger_high", rob: v - high *)
   else (v > low) then MID(true)
                                     (* zc: "trigger_mid", rob: v - low *)
```

Falsification with FADBADml WIP: the heater

Specification: once the temperature is in [ref - low, ref + high], it always stays in [ref - 2 * low, ref + 2 * high]

DEMO

References I

Alexandre Donzé. Breach, a toolbox for verification and parameter synthesis of hybrid systems. In Tayssir Touili, Byron Cook, and Paul Jackson, editors, *Computer Aided Verification*, pages 167–170, Berlin, Heidelberg, 2010. Springer Berlin Heidelberg. ISBN 978-3-642-14295-6.

- Yashwanth Annpureddy, Che Liu, Georgios Fainekos, and Sriram Sankaranarayanan. S-taliro: A tool for temporal logic falsification for hybrid systems. In Parosh Aziz Abdulla and K. Rustan M. Leino, editors, *Tools and Algorithms for the Construction and Analysis of Systems*, pages 254–257, Berlin, Heidelberg, 2011. Springer Berlin Heidelberg. ISBN 978-3-642-19835-9.
- Zhenya Zhang, Ichiro Hasuo, Gidon Ernst, and Sean Sedwards. Two-layered falsification of hybrid systems guided by monte carlo tree search. *CoRR*, abs/1803.06276, 2018. URL http://arxiv.org/abs/1803.06276.

References II

Gidon Ernst, Sean Sedwards, Zhenya Zhang, and Ichiro Hasuo. Fast falsification of hybrid systems using probabilistically adaptive input. *CoRR*, abs/1812.04159, 2018. URL http://arxiv.org/abs/1812.04159.

Takumi Akazaki, Shuang Liu, Yoriyuki Yamagata, Yihai Duan, and Jianye Hao. Falsification of cyber-physical systems using deep reinforcement learning. *CoRR*, abs/1805.00200, 2018. URL http://arxiv.org/abs/1805.00200.

Ole Stauning. Automatic validation of numerical solutions. PhD thesis, 11 1997.

Gidon Ernst, Paolo Arcaini, Alexandre Donz\'e, Georgios Fainekos, Logan Mathesen, Giulia Pedrielli, Shakiba Yaghoubi, Yoriyuki Yamagata, and Zhenya Zhang. Arch-comp 2019 category report: Falsification. In Goran Frehse and Matthias Althoff, editors, *ARCH19. 6th International Workshop on Applied Verification of Continuous and Hybrid Systems*, volume 61 of *EPiC Series in Computing*, pages 129–140. EasyChair, 2019. doi: 10.29007/68dk. URL https://easychair.org/publications/paper/5VWg.

References III

Adel Dokhanchi, Shakiba Yaghoubi, Bardh Hoxha, Georgios Fainekos, Gidon Ernst, Zhenya Zhang, Paolo Arcaini, Ichiro Hasuo, and Sean Sedwards. Arch-comp18 category report: Results on the falsification benchmarks. In Goran Frehse, editor, *ARCH18. 5th International Workshop on Applied Verification of Continuous and Hybrid Systems*, volume 54 of *EPiC Series in Computing*, pages 104–109. EasyChair, 2018. doi: 10.29007/t85q. URL

https://easychair.org/publications/paper/HjJ8.

Bardh Hoxha, Houssam Abbas, and Georgios E. Fainekos. Benchmarks for temporal logic requirements for automotive systems. In *ARCH@CPSWeek*, 2014.

References IV

Nicolas Halbwachs, Fabienne Lagnier, and Pascal Raymond. Synchronous observers and the verification of reactive systems. In *Proceedings of the Third International Conference on Methodology and Software Technology: Algebraic Methodology and Software Technology*, AMAST '93, pages 83–96, Berlin, Heidelberg, 1994.
Springer-Verlag. ISBN 3-540-19852-0. URL http://dl.acm.org/citation.cfm?id=646055.677894.

Sashank J. Reddi, Satyen Kale, and Sanjiv Kumar. On the convergence of adam and beyond. *CoRR*, abs/1904.09237, 2019. URL http://arxiv.org/abs/1904.09237.

Bardh Hoxha, Houssam Abbas, and Georgios Fainekos. Benchmarks for temporal logic requirements for automotive systems. In Goran Frehse and Matthias Althoff, editors, *ARCH14-15. 1st and 2nd International Workshop on Applied veRification for Continuous and Hybrid Systems*, volume 34 of *EPiC Series in Computing*, pages 25–30. EasyChair, 2015. doi: 10.29007/xwrs. URL https://easychair.org/publications/paper/4bfg.